THE HONORABLE JOHN H. CHUN 1 2 3 4 5 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 6 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE 7 8 CASE NO. 2:23-cv-01495-JHC 9 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, et al., STIPULATED MOTION AND 10 [PROPOSED] ORDER Plaintiffs, REGARDING EXPERT 11 **DISCOVERY** v. 12 NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAR: AMAZON.COM, INC., a corporation, January 29, 2024 13 Defendant. 14 15 Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 29, the parties hereto, through their respective counsel of 16 17 record, hereby stipulate to the following regarding the scope of expert discovery and testimony in this action. 18 1. **Definitions** 19 1.1 "Action" means the action filed in this Court under the caption Federal Trade 20 Commission, et al., v. Amazon.com, Inc., 2:23-cv-01495-JHC, including any related discovery, 21 pretrial, trial, post-trial, or appellate proceedings. 22 23 24

- 1.2 "Communication," "Communications," or "Communicated" means any actual or attempted dissemination, disclosure, transmission, transfer or exchange of information, opinions, or thoughts and includes, but is not limited to, written, oral, and electronic correspondence through text messages, social media and online postings, and any content on any messaging applications such as, but not limited to, WhatsApp, Signal, Microsoft Teams, Confide, Facebook Messenger, and Snapchat.
- 1.3 "Consultant" means a Person, retained by a Party or their Testifying Expert specifically for purposes of the Action, to assist that Party in the prosecution or defense of the Action, and who will not provide testimony pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2). For the avoidance of doubt, the term Consultant does not include a Party or a Party's employees.
- 1.4 "Counsel" shall mean, as applied to outside counsel, counsel retained by a Party or Parties in connection with the Action and, with respect to Amazon's outside counsel, any Related Action. As applied to in-house counsel, it shall mean any lawyer employed (or previously employed, at the time of the pertinent communication) by a Party when acting primarily in a legal capacity for that Party. As applied to Plaintiffs, this includes, but is not limited to, (a) any attorneys who are, or previously were (at the time of the pertinent communication), employed by the Federal Trade Commission and acting primarily in a legal capacity for the Federal Trade Commission, and (b) any attorneys who are, or previously were (at the time of the pertinent communication), employed by the relevant office of a Plaintiff State and acting primarily in a legal capacity for that Plaintiff State. As applied to All Parties, the term Counsel also includes, but is not limited to, any economists, financial analysts, statisticians, paralegals, investigators, technologists, administrative assistants, and clerical and administrative personnel employed by, or contracted with, the Party, provided that such employees or

- 1.11 "Staff" means any individual assisting or supporting a Testifying Expert or Consultant specifically for the purposes of this Action. For the avoidance of doubt, it does not include a Party or a Party's employees, except that it includes a Party or Party's employees who are a Testifying Expert required to provide a report pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2) or a Party or Party's employees who assist or support a Party or Party's employees who are required to provide a report pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2).
- 1.13 "Plaintiff States" means the States of Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Nevada, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Oklahoma, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Wisconsin, and any other state or territory of the United States of America that joins the Action.
- 1.14 "Testifying Expert" means a Person, retained by a Party or Parties specifically for purposes of the Action, to assist that Party in the prosecution or defense of the Action, and who is required to provide a report pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B) and/or any other Person who is required to provide an expert report pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2).

2. <u>General Provisions</u>

- 2.1 This Stipulation and Order applies to All Parties to the Action. This Stipulation and Order provides the protocols applicable to conducting discovery relating to Testifying Expert(s), Consultant(s), or their Staff. Nothing herein shall preclude any Party from seeking to modify it later for good cause; prior to doing so, however, counsel of record shall meet and confer among themselves in a good-faith effort to reach agreement as to the appropriate scope of any modifications or revisions to this Stipulation and Order.
- 2.2 All Parties shall not serve subpoenas or discovery requests (for depositions or Documents) on any Testifying Expert, Consultant, or their Staff. Instead, the Party proffering a

Testifying Expert will: (a) be responsible for producing all materials and information required			
under this Stipulation or, to the extent not addressed in this Stipulation, under the Federal Rules			
of Civil Procedure for the Testifying Expert, and (b) upon request, make the Testifying Expert			
available for deposition at or reasonably near the Testifying Expert's workplace, unless			
otherwise agreed by the Parties, and at a time mutually agreed to by All Parties, and consistent			
with the Court's scheduling order(s).			
2.3 All Parties agree to comply with the terms of this Stipulation pending the Court's			
approval and entry of this Stipulation and Order.			

3. Governing Law

3.1 Expert discovery shall be governed by the applicable provisions of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, except as otherwise provided herein or in any other order in this Action. For the avoidance of doubt, the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(A), 26(a)(2)(B), and 26(a)(2)(B)(i) remain in effect and apply to this Action notwithstanding this Stipulation and Order.

4. Expert materials to be disclosed

4.1 In lieu of the disclosures required under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(B)(ii)-(vi), no later than three business days after the service of any Testifying Expert's report pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(B) or otherwise, the Party or Parties proffering the Testifying Expert shall produce¹:

21

20

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

Z 1

22

23

- 4.1.1 A copy of all data or other information referred to in the Testifying Expert's report or declaration and/or relied on by the Testifying Expert in forming the Testifying Expert's opinions (to the extent not already produced in discovery), including, but not limited to, complete copies of all data sets from which information relied upon was derived or obtained, all data and programs underlying any calculations, including all computer programs or code necessary to recreate any data, intermediate working-data, calculations, estimations, tables, or graphics, and including the intermediate working-data files that are generated from any initial ("raw") data files and used in performing the calculations appearing in the report.
- 4.1.2 A list of all Documents referred to in the Testifying Expert's report or declaration and/or relied upon by the Testifying Expert in forming the Testifying Expert's opinions. For purposes of this list, identifying Documents by Bates number is sufficient. To the extent that any such Documents do not already have a Bates number, copies of those documents shall be produced. Such copies of Documents may be produced with a Bates number, but Bates numbering is not required.
- 4.1.3 A statement of the witness's qualifications, including a list of all publications authored, in whole or in part, by the Testifying Expert in the previous 10 years and copies of all such publications that are not readily available publicly, provided that such publications are accessible by the Testifying Expert. Publications which exist only behind a paywall or in print shall be considered as not readily available publicly.
- 4.1.4 A list of all other case(s), wherever those cases took place, in which, during the previous 4 years, the Testifying Expert testified as an expert at trial or by deposition, including the tribunal and case number.

- 4.1.5 A statement of the terms of the compensation and of the compensation paid and/or to be paid to the Testifying Expert for the Testifying Expert's work and testimony in the case.
- 4.2 Testifying Expert reports shall be served via email. Except to the extent included within a Testifying Expert's report, the information required by subparagraphs 4.1.1 4.1.5 above shall be produced electronically in a manner agreed to by All Parties and, and, with respect to paragraph 4.1.1, in machine-readable format, where feasible. All Parties shall meet and confer in good faith to attempt to establish, no later than 15 days after the close of fact discovery, an agreed method for ensuring that the receiving parties are able to complete receipt of the materials by the due date.
- 4.3 Paragraphs 4.1.1 4.1.5 above are not intended to limit the ability of any Party to prepare and use demonstrative exhibits, including demonstrative exhibits that may relate to a Testifying Expert's testimony, during the course of any deposition, hearing, or trial. The use and disclosure of any such demonstrative exhibits shall be governed by the Federal Rules of Evidence, the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and this Court's Local Rules and Orders.

5. Expert materials not requiring disclosure

5.1 Notwithstanding the foregoing and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and except as otherwise required by paragraph 5.2 below, the following materials² shall not be subject to discovery or disclosure by any method (including by deposition):

² Paragraph 5.1 (including subparagraphs 5.1.1 through 5.1.8) shall apply to materials created or communications occurring after the initiation of the Action (i.e., post-Action Documents and communications). Paragraph 5.1 (including subparagraphs 5.1.1 through 5.1.8) shall also apply to materials created or communications occurring prior to the initiation of the Action (i.e., pre-Action Documents and communications), provided that (i) with respect to subparagraphs 5.1.1(a) and 5.1.1(b), all participants in the communication (a) were retained or employed by, on behalf

1	5.1.1	The co	ontent of communications, whether oral or written, only among or
2	between:		
3		(a)	Counsel and a Testifying Expert, Consultant, and/or any Staff
4			assisting the Testifying Expert or Consultant, except to the extent
5			the Testifying Expert relies upon such communications as a basis
6			or reason for his or her opinions;
7		(b)	a Testifying Expert or Consultant and other Testifying Experts and
8			Consultants, as well as any Staff assisting such Testifying Experts
9			or Consultants, except to the extent the Testifying Expert relies
10			upon such communications as a basis or reason for his or her
11			opinions; and
12		(c)	a Testifying Expert or Consultant and any Staff assisting such
13			Testifying Expert or Consultant. ³
14			
15			earty at the time of the communication and the communication was
16	made in connection with, or in anticipation of, the Action or, with respect to Amazon, any Related Action, or (b) all participants in the communication were retained or employed by, on		
17	time of the communic	cation a	ntiffs, or investigating states that did not become Plaintiffs, at the nd the communication was made in connection with, or in
18	retained or employed	by or o	nd (ii) with respect to subparagraph 5.1.2, the Testifying Expert was n behalf of a Party in the Action or, with respect to Amazon, any
19	Related Action at the time the materials were prepared, and the materials were prepared on behalf of the same Party that retained or employed the Testifying Expert in the Action or, with respect to Amazon, any Related Action, and the materials were prepared in connection with, or		
20	in anticipation of, the	Action	or, with respect to Amazon, any Related Action.
21	Action or any Related Action. Communications between or among Counsel for (a) different		
22			
23			etion) are included within this provision. Additionally, on, this expert stipulation does not, and is not intended to, abridge
24	the attorney-client pri	ivilege.	

1	5.1.2	Drafts	of Testifying Expert reports, affidavits, declarations, or other
2	Testifying Expert materials, including, without limitation:		
3		(a)	draft studies, analyses, opinions, or written expert testimony
4			prepared in connection with the Action or any Related Action;
5		(b)	draft Testifying Expert work papers prepared in connection with
6			the Action or any Related Action; and
7		(c)	draft computer code (including queries), preliminary or
8			intermediate calculations, computations, modeling, intermediate
9			working data files, log files reflecting draft computer code, or data
10			runs prepared in connection with the Action or any Related Action,
11			except as described in paragraph 4.1.1.
12	5.1.3	The no	otes of a Testifying Expert, Consultant, or Staff, except for notes of
13	interviews of persons where the Testifying Expert, Consultant, or Staff participated in or		
14	conducted the interview and where the Testifying Expert relied on the interview in forming any		
15	opinions in his or her final report.		
16	5.1.4 Any comments, whether oral or written, related to a final or draft report,		
17	affidavit, declaration, or potential testimony of a Testifying Expert prepared in connection with		
18	the Action or any Related Action by:		
19		(a)	Counsel;
20		(b)	a Consultant;
21		(c)	Staff;
22		(d)	any other Testifying Expert;
23		(e)	any other Consultant; or
24			

1	(f) Staff of another Testifying Expert or Consultant.
2	5.1.5 Budgets, invoices, bills, receipts, or time records concerning Testifying
3	Experts, Consultants, or Staff. Notwithstanding this provision, any Party may inquire into a
4	Testifying Expert's compensation in this matter, including the Testifying Expert's hourly rates,
5	the total hours spent by the Testifying Expert and staff members in connection with this Action,
6	and any other payments or consideration received by the Testifying Expert relating to work in
7	the Action.
8	5.1.6 Copies of programs, software, or instructions that are commercially
9	available at a reasonable cost.
10	5.1.7 Documents that are readily available publicly, provided that they are
11	identified with sufficient specificity to allow the opposing side to locate and obtain the
12	Documents. Publications which exist only behind a paywall or in print shall be considered as not
13	readily available publicly.
14	5.1.8 Documents that have previously been produced during discovery in the
15	Action, provided that they are identified by Bates number in the Testifying Expert's report.
16	5.2 Notwithstanding any provision in paragraph 5 (including all subparagraphs), All
17	Parties must produce (according to paragraphs 4.1.1, 4.1.2, and 4.2 above) all materials that:
18	(a) constitute facts or data that the Testifying Expert relied on in
19	forming the opinions expressed in his or her report; or
20	(b) constitute assumptions that the Testifying Expert relied on in
21	forming the opinions expressed in his or her report.
22	Information, communications, materials, or Documents upon which the Testifying Expert relies
23	as a basis for their opinions are discoverable. For the avoidance of doubt, nothing herein relieves
24	

1	Stipulated to and respectfully submitte	d this 29th day of January, 2024, by:
2	<u>S.</u>	/ Edward H. Takashima
2		SUSAN A. MUSSER (DC Bar # 1531486) EDWARD H. TAKASHIMA (DC Bar # 1001641)
3		DANIELLE C. QUINN (NY Reg. # 5408943)
4		COLIN M. HERD (NY Reg. # 5665740)
5		Gederal Trade Commission 100 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
		Vashington, DC 20580
6	1	Tel.: (202) 326-2122 (Musser) (202) 326-2464 (Takashima)
7	E	Email: smusser@ftc.gov etakashima@ftc.gov
8		dquinn@ftc.gov
0		cherd@ftc.gov
9	A	Ittorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission
10		
11	s/ Michael Jo	s/ Alexandra C. Sosnowski
12	Michael Jo (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>) Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Bureau	Alexandra C. Sosnowski (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)
12	New York State Office of the Attorney	Assistant Attorney General
13	General	Consumer Protection and Antitrust Bureau
	28 Liberty Street	New Hampshire Department of Justice
14	New York, NY 10005	Office of the Attorney General One Granite Place South
1.5	Telephone: (212) 416-6537 Email: Michael.Jo@ag.ny.gov	Concord, NH 03301
15	Counsel for Plaintiff State of New York	Telephone: (603) 271-2678
1.0	Counsel for Flainliff state of New Tork 	Email: Alexandra.c.sosnowski@doj.nh.gov
16	s/ Rahul A. Darwar	Counsel for Plaintiff State of New Hampshire
17	Rahul A. Darwar (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)	Counsel for I turning state of New Hampshire
1 /	Assistant Attorney General	s/ Caleb J. Smith
18	Office of the Attorney General of Connecticut	
10	165 Capitol Avenue	Assistant Attorney General
19	Hartford, CT 06016	Consumer Protection Unit
	Telephone: (860) 808-5030	Office of the Oklahoma Attorney General
20	Email: Rahul.Darwar@ct.gov	15 West 6th Street, Suite 1000
	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Connecticut	Tulsa, OK 74119
21		Telephone: (918) 581-2230
22		Email: <u>caleb.smith@oag.ok.gov</u> Counsel for Plaintiff State of Oklahoma
<i></i>		
23		
24		

1	s/Jennifer A. Thomson	<u>s/ Michael Mackenzie</u>
	Jennifer A. Thomson (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)	Michael Mackenzie (admitted pro hac vice)
2	Senior Deputy Attorney General	Deputy Chief, Antitrust Division
	Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General	Office of the Massachusetts Attorney General
3	Strawberry Square, 14th Floor	One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
	Harrisburg, PA 17120	Boston, MA 02108
4	Telephone: (717) 787-4530	Telephone: (617) 963-2369
	Email: jthomson@attorneygeneral.gov	Email: michael.mackenzie@mass.gov
5	Counsel for Plaintiff Commonwealth of	Counsel for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
	Pennsylvania	Massachusetts
6		
	s/ Michael A. Undorf	s/Scott A. Mertens
7	Michael A. Undorf (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)	Scott A. Mertens (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)
	Deputy Attorney General	Assistant Attorney General
8	Delaware Department of Justice	Michigan Department of Attorney General
	820 N. French St., 5th Floor	525 West Ottawa Street
9	Wilmington, DE 19801	Lansing, MI 48933
	Telephone: (302) 683-8816	Telephone: (517) 335-7622
10	Email: michael.undorf@delaware.gov	Email: MertensS@michigan.gov
	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Delaware	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Michigan
11		
	s/ Christina M. Moylan	s/ Zach Biesanz
12	Christina M. Moylan (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)	Zach Biesanz (admitted pro hac vice)
	Assistant Attorney General	Senior Enforcement Counsel
13	Chief, Consumer Protection Division	Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
	Office of the Maine Attorney General	445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1400
14	6 State House Station	Saint Paul, MN 55101
	Augusta, ME 04333-0006	Telephone: (651) 757-1257
15	Telephone: (207) 626-8800	Email: <u>zach.biesanz@ag.state.mn.us</u>
	Email: christina.moylan@maine.gov	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Minnesota
16	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Maine	/I I T
1.7	g/Cam, Haniak	<u>s/Lucas J. Tucker</u> Lyans L. Tyakar (admitted pro han via)
17	s/ Gary Honick Gary Honick (admitted pro hac vice)	Lucas J. Tucker (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>) Senior Deputy Attorney General
1.0	Assistant Attorney General	Office of the Nevada Attorney General
18	Deputy Chief, Antitrust Division	100 N. Carson St.
10	Office of the Maryland Attorney General	Carson City, NV 89701
19	200 St. Paul Place	Telephone: (775) 684-1100
20	Baltimore, MD 21202	Email: LTucker@ag.nv.gov
20	Telephone: (410) 576-6474	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Nevada
21	Email: Ghonick@oag.state.md.us	Counsel for 1 turning state of the rada
41	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Maryland	
22	Some of training state of trial years	
	II.	

23

1	s/ Ana Atta-Alla	
-	Ana Atta-Alla (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i>)	
2	Deputy Attorney General	s/Stephen N. Provazza
	New Jersey Office of the Attorney General	Stephen N. Provazza (admitted pro hac vice)
3	124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor	Special Assistant Attorney General
	Newark, NJ 07101	Chief, Consumer and Economic Justice Unit
4	Telephone: (973) 648-3070	Department of the Attorney General
	Email: Ana.Atta-Alla@law.njoag.gov	150 South Main Street
5	Counsel for Plaintiff State of New Jersey	Providence, RI 02903
		Telephone: (401) 274-4400
6	s/ Jeffrey Herrera	Email: sprovazza@riag.ri.gov
	Jeffrey Herrera (admitted pro hac vice)	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island
7	Assistant Attorney General	
	New Mexico Office of the Attorney General	s/ Gwendolyn J. Cooley
8	408 Galisteo St.	Gwendolyn J. Cooley (admitted pro hac vice)
	Santa Fe, NM 87501	Assistant Attorney General
9	Telephone: (505) 490-4878	Wisconsin Department of Justice
	Email: jherrera@nmag.gov	Post Office Box 7857
0	Counsel for Plaintiff State of New Mexico	Madison, WI 53707-7857
		Telephone: (608) 261-5810
1	s/Timothy D. Smith	Email: cooleygj@doj.state.wi.us
	Timothy D. Smith, WSBA No. 44583	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin
12	Senior Assistant Attorney General	
	Antitrust and False Claims Unit	
13	Oregon Department of Justice	
	100 SW Market St	
14	Portland, OR 97201 Telephone: (503) 934-4400	
15	Email: tim.smith@doj.state.or.us	
13	Counsel for Plaintiff State of Oregon	
16	Counsel for I turning state of Oregon	
10		
17		
. /		
18		
		MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
19		
		By: s/Patty Eakes
20		Patty A. Eakes, WSBA #18888
		Molly A. Terwilliger, WSBA #28449
21		1301 Second Avenue, Suite 2800
		Seattle, WA 98101
22		Phone: (206) 274-6400
		Email: patty.eakes@morganlewis.com
23		molly.terwilliger@morganlewis.com
24		

1	WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
2	Heidi K. Hubbard (<i>pro hac vice</i>) John E. Schmidtlein (<i>pro hac vice</i>)
3	Kevin M. Hodges (<i>pro hac vice</i>) Jonathan B. Pitt (<i>pro hac vice</i>)
4	Carl R. Metz (<i>pro hac vice</i>) Carol J. Pruski (<i>pro hac vice</i>)
5	Constance T. Forkner (<i>pro hac vice</i>) 680 Maine Avenue SW
6	Washington, DC 20024 Phone: (202) 434-5000
7	Email: hhubbard@wc.com khodges@wc.com
8	jpitt@wc.com cmetz@wc.com
9	<u>cpruski@wc.com</u> <u>cforkner@wc.com</u>
10	COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
11	Thomas O. Barnett (pro hac vice)
12	One CityCenter 850 Tenth Street, NW Weshington, DC 20001, 4056
13	Washington, DC 20001-4956 Phone: (202) 662-5407 Email: tbarnett@cov.com
14	Attorneys for Defendant Amazon.com, Inc.
15 16	Autorneys for Defendant Amazon.com, the
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

1	[PROPOSED]	ORDER
2	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
3	DATED this day of	, 2024.
4		
5		JOHN H. CHUN
6		UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
7	Presented By:	
8	s/Edward H. Takashima	
9	SUSAN A. MUSSER (DC Bar # 1531486) EDWARD H. TAKASHIMA (DC Bar # 1001641)	
10	DANIELLE C. QUINN (NY Reg. # 5408943) COLIN M. HERD (NY Reg. # 5665740)	
11	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW	
12	Washington, DC 20580 Tel.: (202) 326-2122 (Musser)	
13	(202) 326-2464 (Takashima) Email: smusser@ftc.gov	
14	etakashima@ftc.gov dquinn@ftc.gov	
15	cherd@ftc.gov	
16	Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		